

To: Shaw, Betsy[Shaw.Betsy@epa.gov]; Rodan, Bruce[rodan.bruce@epa.gov]; Siciliano, CarolAnn[Siciliano.CarolAnn@epa.gov]; Grifo, Francesca[Grifo.Francesca@epa.gov]; Reeder, John[Reeder.John@epa.gov]
Cc: Hawkins, CherylA[Hawkins.CherylA@epa.gov]; Otto, Martha[Otto.Martha@epa.gov]
From: Teichman, Kevin
Sent: Tue 4/25/2017 3:41:23 PM
Subject: Re: Allegation #124

Flows for me. May not address Bruce's comment.

Kevin Teichman

Senior Science Advisor

Office of Research and Development (8101R)

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW

Washington, DC 20460

Phone: (301) 975-6421

Fax: (301) 975-4409

From: Shaw, Betsy
Sent: Tuesday, April 25, 2017 11:27:25 AM
To: Teichman, Kevin; Rodan, Bruce; Siciliano, CarolAnn; Grifo, Francesca; Reeder, John
Cc: Hawkins, CherylA; Otto, Martha
Subject: RE: Allegation #124

DELIBERATIVE

Not to complicate matters further, but it strikes me that a little reordering might improve flow and help us shorten the response. See what you think.

From: Teichman, Kevin
Sent: Tuesday, April 25, 2017 10:45 AM
To: Rodan, Bruce <rodan.bruce@epa.gov>; Siciliano, CarolAnn <Siciliano.CarolAnn@epa.gov>; Grifo, Francesca <Grifo.Francesca@epa.gov>; Reeder, John <Reeder.John@epa.gov>; Shaw, Betsy <Shaw.Betsy@epa.gov>
Cc: Hawkins, CherylA <Hawkins.CherylA@epa.gov>; Otto, Martha <Otto.Martha@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: Allegation #124

If replacing expressing "a scientific opinion" with expressing "an opinion on a scientific matter" satisfies Bruce's concern, I can live with this change.

Kevin Teichman

Senior Science Advisor

Office of Research and Development (8101R)

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW

Washington, DC 20460

Phone: (301) 975-6421

Fax: (301) 975-4409

From: Rodan, Bruce
Sent: Tuesday, April 25, 2017 10:28:58 AM
To: Siciliano, CarolAnn; Teichman, Kevin; Grifo, Francesca; Reeder, John; Shaw, Betsy
Cc: Hawkins, CherylA; Otto, Martha
Subject: RE: Allegation #124

DELIBERATIVE

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

Bruce Rodan

From: Siciliano, CarolAnn
Sent: Tuesday, April 25, 2017 9:57 AM
To: Teichman, Kevin <Teichman.Kevin@epa.gov>; Rodan, Bruce <rodan.bruce@epa.gov>; Grifo, Francesca <Grifo.Francesca@epa.gov>; Reeder, John <Reeder.John@epa.gov>; Shaw, Betsy <Shaw.Betsy@epa.gov>
Cc: Hawkins, CherylA <Hawkins.CherylA@epa.gov>; Otto, Martha <Otto.Martha@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Allegation #124

I am comfortable with Kevin's edits.

Carol Ann Siciliano

Associate General Counsel

Cross-Cutting Issues Law Office

Office of General Counsel

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

(202) 564-5489

siciliano.carolann@epa.gov

From: Teichman, Kevin
Sent: Tuesday, April 25, 2017 8:14 AM
To: Rodan, Bruce <rodan.bruce@epa.gov>; Siciliano, CarolAnn <Siciliano.CarolAnn@epa.gov>; Grifo, Francesca <Grifo.Francesca@epa.gov>; Reeder, John <Reeder.John@epa.gov>; Shaw, Betsy <Shaw.Betsy@epa.gov>
Cc: Hawkins, CherylA <Hawkins.CherylA@epa.gov>; Otto, Martha <Otto.Martha@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: Allegation #124

This email is for internal, deliberative use only.

Building on Carol Ann's comments (I assume Bruce had none), attached are my comments on the memorandum.

Building on Bruce's comments, attached are my comments on the panel report.

Kevin Teichman

Senior Science Advisor

Office of Research and Development (8101R)

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW

Washington, DC 20460

Phone: (301) 975-6421

Fax: (301) 975-4409

From: Rodan, Bruce
Sent: Monday, April 24, 2017 7:20:37 PM
To: Siciliano, CarolAnn; Grifo, Francesca; Reeder, John; Teichman, Kevin; Shaw, Betsy
Cc: Hawkins, CherylA; Otto, Martha
Subject: RE: Allegation #124

CarolAnn,

Thanks to Francesca and you for the rapid edits. I am a little concerned that maybe a little too much text has been added. I am inclined toward parsimony. How about the attached redline

Bruce Rodan

From: Siciliano, CarolAnn
Sent: Monday, April 24, 2017 7:10 PM
To: Grifo, Francesca <Grifo.Francesca@epa.gov>; Reeder, John <Reeder.John@epa.gov>; Teichman, Kevin <Teichman.Kevin@epa.gov>; Rodan, Bruce <rodan.bruce@epa.gov>; Shaw, Betsy <Shaw.Betsy@epa.gov>
Cc: Hawkins, CherylA <Hawkins.CherylA@epa.gov>; Otto, Martha <Otto.Martha@epa.gov>
Subject: RE: Allegation #124

Thank you for turning this around so quickly, Francesca. I have a few comments on the draft letter and the accompanying decision document. Take a look at the draft decision document first. I incorporated some (but not) all of the same edits into the letter.

Ex. 5 - Deliberative Process

p.s. A person named Denise Shaw was on Francesca's original email instead of Betsy Shaw.

I've deleted Denise and added Betsy.

Carol Ann Siciliano

Associate General Counsel

Cross-Cutting Issues Law Office

Office of General Counsel

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

(202) 564-5489

siciliano.carolann@epa.gov

From: Grifo, Francesca

Sent: Monday, April 24, 2017 5:53 PM

To: Reeder, John <Reeder.John@epa.gov>; Shaw, Denice <Shaw.Denice@epa.gov>; Siciliano, CarolAnn <Siciliano.CarolAnn@epa.gov>; Teichman, Kevin <Teichman.Kevin@epa.gov>; Rodan, Bruce <rodan.bruce@epa.gov>

Cc: Hawkins, CherylA <Hawkins.CherylA@epa.gov>; Otto, Martha <Otto.Martha@epa.gov>

Subject: Allegation #124

Thank you all for your time and for the excellent discussion this morning. I appreciate your feedback. I dug out our coordinating procedures with the OIG and they clearly state that "The Scientific Integrity Official will respond to the complainant for these allegations." This is under number 2 on the second page. I have attached them for your perusal. If we decide that this applies to this allegation, then I will redo the attached memo and make it a letter to the Sierra Club. I have also attached the Review Panel Report and letter/memo back to our alligator or the IG. Please do not share these documents beyond this group. When they are final we will likely post them on the internet for all to see, but these drafts are marked deliberative – and we are deliberating so please do not distribute, quote or otherwise share.

Please send me comments, edits and concerns regarding the letter/memo and report as soon as you have them. And please weigh in on this – it looks to me like we should respond to Sierra Club and not the IG but I want your feedback on that. Please read the letter in its entirety. I made some tweaks to the language throughout.

Again – thank you for your time in the midst of so many other pulls on your attention. I appreciate how seriously you take scientific integrity and our adjudication of allegations.

Best,

Francesca

Francesca T. Grifo, Ph. D.

Scientific Integrity Official

US EPA Office of the Science Advisor

202-564-1687

<http://www.epa.gov/osa/basic-information-about-scientific-integrity>